



**TIPPERARY HISTORICAL JOURNAL  
2000**

**© County Tipperary Historical Society**

**[www.tipperaryllibraries.ie/th](http://www.tipperaryllibraries.ie/th)  
[society@tipperaryllibraries.ie](mailto:society@tipperaryllibraries.ie)**

**ISSN 0791-0655**

## Books Section – reviews and notices

---

**Religious Renewal and Reform in the Pastoral Ministry of Bishop James Doyle of Kildare and Leighlin 1787-1834.** By Thomas McGrath. (Four Courts Press, 1999). 331 pages. £35.

James Doyle, bishop of Kildare and Leighlin from 1819 until his death in 1834, is a doubly famous figure in the history of nineteenth-century Irish Catholicism. He was the outstanding Catholic controversialist of his day, writing extensively on political, social and religious issues. He was also the subject of one of the most striking ecclesiastical biographies of the century. W. J. Fitzpatrick's *The Life, Times and Correspondence of the Rt. Rev. Dr. Doyle*, first published in 1861, offered a vivid portrayal of a crusading bishop, who replaced the relaxed and permissive regime of his predecessors with new standards of discipline and performance. In *Politics, Interdenominational Relations and Education*, separately reviewed in this journal, Thomas McGrath has analysed the first aspect of Doyle's career, as polemicist and apologist. *Religious Renewal and Reform*, with which we are concerned here, deals with the second aspect, as ecclesiastical administrator and reformer.

To appreciate the significance of Fitzpatrick's biography, it is necessary to take account of the direction which the history of the Irish Catholic church has taken in recent decades. In a series of influential books and articles commencing in the 1960s Professor Emmet Larkin argued that the nineteenth century saw the transformation of Irish Catholicism into its modern form. This transformation had two phases. In the first, extending from the late eighteenth century to the 1840s, a new generation of reforming bishops slowly but steadily eradicated deeply rooted habits of laxity and indiscipline among the lower clergy, suppressing the clerical vices of intemperance, excessive financial demands on parishioners, and (less commonly) sexual immorality, reasserting episcopal authority over factious and independent-minded parish priests, and insisting on higher standards of pastoral performance. The second phase, in the twenty or thirty years after the Famine, saw what Larkin famously labelled the "devotional revolution", a dramatic increase in levels of church attendance, combined with the introduction of a wide range of new devotional forms, through which, in Larkin's phrase, "the great mass of the Irish people became practising Catholics" within the space of a single generation.

In the debate that has inevitably followed Larkin's dramatic claims, Fitzpatrick's biography has played a significant part. His account depicted a vigorous and committed episcopal administrator, struggling to eradicate long-standing complacency and neglect. Descriptions of parish clergy who had to be forbidden to spend their time fox hunting or frequenting race meetings, of strict new rules to restrict clerical avarice and visitations where the bishop was driven physically to destroy tattered and shabby vestments or cracked and damaged altar equipment, all seemed vividly to confirm the picture of a dramatic internal reformation. Fitzpatrick had less to say about popular religious practice, but there too references to Doyle confirming large numbers of adults previously left unprovided for, and laying down new rules for regular preaching and religious instruction, seemed to provide at least partial support for Larkin's thesis of a "devotional revolution". Hence it was little surprise that Fitzpatrick's two volumes have continued to be widely cited. At the same time it was from the start impossible not to be uncasily aware that all this material derived from what was essentially a work of mid-Victorian hagiography, and that what has long been needed has been a modern biography, returning to the original sources to confirm or correct Fitzpatrick's work.

This is what Dr. McGrath has now provided. He draws on the archives of the diocese of



Kildare and Leighlin and of a range of other ecclesiastical institutions, including those of Doyle's Augustinian order, of Carlow College where he taught, and of Propaganda Fide, with which he corresponded extensively. These are supplemented by a wide range of other manuscript sources in which Doyle figures directly or indirectly, as well as by contemporary newspapers and the voluminous material, including Doyle's own evidence to commissions of enquiry into Irish conditions, contained in the British Parliamentary Papers. The results of this massive research are at times paraded in excessive detail. The account of Doyle's appointment, for example, is followed by a flat, factual list of parishes subdivided and deans appointed; a chapter on the religious orders catalogues every interaction that took place, from trivial transactions to major controversies, such as Doyle's clash with the Jesuits of Clongowes Wood, whose perceived laxity as confessors alarmed him. The 219 pages of text are followed by no less than 120 pages of appendices and notes. Despite this occasional lack of selectivity, however, Dr. McGrath does full justice to his important subject, providing a painstaking and judicious analysis of every aspect of Doyle's episcopate.

Where the organisational character of the nineteenth-century church is concerned, the outcome is broadly to confirm the picture presented by Fitzpatrick. Dr. McGrath qualifies some of his predecessor's more colourful assertions. Even then, however, his criticisms are generally mild. (Fitzpatrick's claim that before Doyle's arrival the parish clergy of Kildare and Leighlin ejaculated "Tally Ho" as often as "Pax Vobiscum", for example, is "to over state the case though it had perhaps some basis in fact" (p. 78). Dr. McGrath's overall portrayal, meanwhile, provides ample support for the image of a vigorous reformer let loose on a diocese in which standards fell well short of normal requirements. During his fifteen-year rule Doyle worked to impose strict controls on the recruitment and training of priests, both at Carlow College and in Maynooth, of which he was a trustee. In his first ten years 27 new churches were erected, 22 existing ones were rebuilt and 43 others were substantially improved; in 1833 a new cathedral was opened in Carlow. He maintained morale and high standards of performance among his clergy by regular visitations, and by the institution of annual or bi-annual retreats and theological conferences. He strictly regulated the fees demanded by the parish clergy, and prohibited engagement in large-scale farming ventures, which appear to have been common. He required priests to wear a distinctive clerical dress, sharply curtailed their participation in the social life of the laity, and dealt sternly with those accused of financial malpractice, drunkenness or other deviations from a strict code of conduct. Reform also extended to the regular clergy: wandering friars were outlawed within the diocese, and settled communities of both men and women brought under stricter control. In addition Doyle sought to improve the quality of lay religious life, sponsoring confraternities of the eucharist and of the Christian Doctrine, promoting parochial libraries, acting as patron of the Catholic Book Society, and lobbying at Rome for reform of the law relating to clandestine marriage and for a reduction in what he regarded as the excessive number of holy days.

If Dr. McGrath is prepared to endorse the main outlines of Fitzpatrick's account, he is far less ready to accept the broader interpretations to which it might be seen as contributing support. Despite Doyle's evident dissatisfaction with much of what he found on taking over Kildare and Leighlin, the level of serious delinquency among his clergy was, Dr. McGrath insists, very low. Doyle's reforms did not amount to a radical discontinuity in the development of Irish Catholicism. Rather they represented the perfecting of existing administrative and disciplinary structures. Dr. McGrath rejects even more vigorously the suggestion that the laity of this period were for the most part not practising Catholics in the modern sense. Attendance at Sunday mass, at 61-74%, was considerably higher than has been suggested in Prof. David Miller's



controversial analysis of the data collected in the mid-1830s by the Commissioners of Public Instruction. Few failed to confess and receive communion at least once a year at Easter. All but a small minority of children attended Sunday schools, while large numbers of adults were members of religious confraternities.

Dr. McGrath's careful and exhaustively documented analysis lends powerful support to those who have argued that changes in religious habits during the nineteenth century were more gradual and evolutionary than the notion of a mid-century "devotional revolution" would suggest. At the same time two points should perhaps be made. The first is that it is essential, in assessing these findings, to bear in mind the area to which they relate. The diocese of Kildare and Leighlin took in large parts of the counties of Kildare, Carlow, Queen's County and King's County, and smaller parts of Counties Wexford, Wicklow, and Kilkenny. Doyle's writings leave little doubt regarding the acute economic hardship endured by the Catholic poor under his spiritual care. But it must also be recognised that this was overall a comparatively prosperous zone, with a well developed network of towns and a countryside dominated by medium-sized commercial farms. This is significant because Larkin and even more Miller have always accepted that religious practice, even before the Famine, was more frequent and sophisticated in the anglicised and commercialised east than in most other regions of Ireland. Taken as a critique of the devotional revolution thesis, Dr. McGrath's evidence is thus somewhat less compelling than it would be if it is related to a poorer and more westerly diocese.

The second point concerns the way in which the deficiencies in discipline and pastoral provision which Doyle encountered on taking over Kildare and Leighlin are to be explained. The reason why the full discipline of the Council of Trent had not previously been extended to Ireland, Dr. McGrath suggests, was that penal legislation and state harassment had made this impossible. An alternative explanation would be that Irish Catholic society in the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries had its own distinctive religious needs, that were in many respects better served by the pattern, the festive wake and the rituals of popular magic than by the official rituals of the Counter Reformation church. In this context that old style rural priest, tolerant of local cults and observances and convivially present at the social gatherings of his parishioners, should be seen, not as a deviant or delinquent, but as someone fulfilling a recognised and generally accepted social function. From this point of view it could be argued that the reform programme of the nineteenth century is still better understood as the replacement of one religious culture by another, even if the process was more gradual and less dramatic than has been claimed. But that is a matter for debate and further investigation. And, whatever the outcome, Dr. McGrath is to be congratulated for a major contribution to our knowledge and understanding of a central issue in the evolution of modern Irish society.

*S. J. Connolly*

**Politics, interdenominational relations and education in the public ministry of Bishop James Doyle of Kildare and Leighlin.** By Thomas McGrath. (Four Courts Press, 1999). 353 pages. £35.

James Warren Doyle believed that the duty of a bishop to promote the temporal concerns of his flock was no less than the obligation to care for its spiritual needs. In the fifteen years of his episcopacy he devoted his great intellectual gifts and considerable physical energy to a wide range of causes, including the admission of Catholics to parliament, a system of public assistance for the poor, the abolition of tithes payments by Catholics to the clergy of the Church of Ireland and public provision for church controlled schools. His activities made him the

quintessential priest-in-politics, albeit a politics at one remove. He believed that his position was divinely ordained and that it owed nothing to jobbery, to corruption, to family connection or a worldly canvass.

Thus his support for public causes was given from an episcopal seat circumscribed by conventions that appeared to place him above party conflict. Doyle's interest in what many people regarded as purely secular issues sprang from the belief that his fellow Catholics were denied essential civil rights: they were not only citizens but also members of an historic national church which had suffered at the hands of an intrusive and aggrandising force. For example, his support for Catholic Emancipation, even as some of his fellow bishops remained aloof from the campaign, was based on the assumption that this was not just another episode in the history of parliamentary reform, but more fundamentally a matter of undoing a wrong that originated at the Reformation.

Doyle's tireless advocacy on behalf of his flock was grounded not only on the teaching of the Church but also on the works of social theorists such as Locke and Burke. He used weapons forged in Trinity and in Oxford as well as in Paris and Maynooth. His fluency in the language of his opponents surprised, confounded and finally vanquished them. Whereas the primate, Daniel Murray of Dublin, was quiescent and appeasing, Doyle was provocative and combative. Thus he was not slow to use the territorial tag in his episcopal title contrary to law and to the intense annoyance of Dublin Castle. He believed that in the absence of a displaced Catholic aristocracy the Catholic bishops could instead provide leadership, patronage and a force for social stability. Such a role was being claimed by the bishops of the Church of Ireland and what he referred to as that "monstrous" establishment became a prime target of his ire.

As a result of its pretensions, his own church was starved of resources and while the proselytising of over-enthusiastic evangelicals may not have been a serious threat to his flock, its effrontery could not go unchallenged. Nonetheless he was on good terms with some Protestant clergymen and prepared to acknowledge the benevolent disposition of moderates such as Richard Laurence, archbishop of Cashel and Emly. Doyle's public ministry while bishop of Kildare and Leighlin from 1819 to 1834 forms the subject matter of this meticulously researched companion to Dr. McGrath's volume on Doyle's work for religious reform and renewal.

Dr. McGrath shows how Doyle's initial interest in national politics was stirred when along with his fellow bishops he contemplated the implications of accepting 'securities' such as a state veto on episcopal nominations being demanded in return for Emancipation. His sense of outrage was channelled into the carefully argued *Vindication of the religious and civil principles of the Irish Catholics*, published in 1823, which introduced him to a wide public and led to his adoption as an essential part of the apparatus of the Catholic Association. During the next few years his evidence before various parliamentary committees and a series of brilliant essays won many powerful converts to the case for the admission of Catholics to parliament. In particular, his skilful marshalling of evidence, in support of the proposition that there was no conflict between the temporal allegiance which subjects owed their king and the spiritual allegiance owed the pope, proved decisive. Nonetheless, the contrast of the judicious and conciliatory pleading at Westminster with the fiery tone of writings aimed at an Irish audience, brought accusations of duplicity and even subversiveness.

He was far from being a rabble-rouser, however, and he grew anxious at any sign of social unrest such the gathering of militant peasants in Tipperary in 1828. O'Connell's apparent willingness to concede on the securities issue worried Doyle and, while they maintained a public partnership, they remained suspicious of each other. O'Connell's demagogic posturing



embarrassed Doyle and he believed that in certain circumstances he might even sell the cause short. However, when O'Connell accepted that the forty-shilling freeholders would have to give up their vote as part of the price for the admission of Catholics to parliament, Doyle concurred. He argued, perhaps disingenuously, that the franchise qualification was an essentially political issue and not his concern, but, like O'Connell, he knew that a refusal to concede that security might jeopardise the only real prize of the Emancipation campaign.

Emancipation did not bring all that the term seemed to imply. Hoped for reforms and concessions were as distant as ever and O'Connell declared that until the Union was repealed, Ireland would not rest. Doyle remained aloof from that cause and seemed convinced that even if it could be attained, the likely price – civil strife and bloodshed – would be too high. He was not a political radical: the abolition of the penal code was necessary only so that Catholics could enjoy “existing privileges and rights” and not because the existing social system might be restructured. Yet in some areas of social policy he took up a position that was far from conservative. He was a strong advocate of a poor law reform grounded on the tenets of Christian charity. Dr. McGrath carefully reconstructs Doyle's thinking on poverty and shows how it was a cause of bitter friction between him and O'Connell, whose conventional enough view was that state provision for the poor would serve only to promote their indolence while placing an intolerable burden on the state, as he understood it, and on taxpayers such as himself.

The intersection of religious doctrine and political reality was at its most acute in matters of education. In Doyle's mind, education by definition had to be underpinned with Christian teaching: a schooling that did not include a grounding in religious practice and belief was not only incomplete but carried the seeds of amorality and apostasy. Like many of his contemporaries, he viewed privately owned schools with suspicion. His low opinion of them was due less to any lack of skill or commitment on the part of their owners than to the extent to which religious instruction was not central to their curriculum. A free trade in schooling, whereby any lettered individual could set up a school free of supervision, was a cause of continuing anxiety to religious and civil authorities alike and, as the demand for schooling increased from the 1780s onwards, the construction of an administrative scheme that would bring schooling under control became urgent.

Since the Reformation the state had placed the supervision of schooling under the clergy of its church, the Church of Ireland. Doyle's project was to get the government to accept that the Catholic clergy had a legitimate role as patrons and managers of schools attended by their flock and that in educational matters they too could act as agents of the state. Such a development would require the setting aside of a constitutional principle that had underpinned state support of schooling since the Reformation – that the Anglican established church had the sole legal right to oversee the instruction of all citizens. To win the case, Doyle and his brother bishops had to take on not just the state-supported voluntary societies such as the Kildare Place Society but also the Anglican establishment, for whom this became an issue of even greater significance than Emancipation. If the role of the Church of Ireland as arbiter of the country's educational needs were to be undermined and removed, could its other prerogatives as an established church survive much longer?

Dr. McGrath takes the reader behind the narrative of parliamentary decision-making written thirty years ago by Donald Akenson and reveals how Doyle constructed a case and convinced those who mattered. A turning point in his battle came when he and the other bishops indicated their willingness to accept a scheme of state-funded locally-managed schools, wherein children of all religions would be taught secular subjects together but separated for religion. This would have the effect of confining religious instruction to part of the school day



or even to a particular day, something that was unacceptable to most Anglicans and Presbyterians.

Doyle may not have been too happy with that either, but the prospect of state funding for his schools and the recognition of the episcopal demand to supervise religious instruction convinced him that the scheme for national education should be supported. It would be many decades before the Protestant authorities could be tempted to participate in the scheme and as a result, in most parts of the country, the new national schools developed largely as *de facto* Catholic schools, ones that the bishops could increasingly mould to their requirements. Whether Doyle anticipated that is less than clear, but the result was the emergence of a system that remains more or less intact today and is Doyle's greatest bequest to his church.

This volume and its companion form an indispensable guide to the achievements of a man who was arguably the single most important Catholic cleric of the first half of the nineteenth century. Its tone is generally judicious and balanced, though the author is not afraid to let out an occasional cheer on behalf of his hero. Not unreasonably, it assumes some background knowledge on the part of its readers, whom it also expects to have stamina. If I have a criticism, one that might be directed less at the author than to his editor, it is that two of the four chapters are up to 40,000 words in length, the size of some medium-size monographs, and that the reader must work through those luxuriant forests without benefit of a single sub-heading or any other guide to their varied and intertwined themes.

This book supplies everything that the reader is likely to need to know on the work of a major public figure, but it is almost silent on the inner life – on the personal forces and psychology that underpinned and ultimately gave meaning to the public work. Its author succeeds brilliantly in getting the reader to focus closely on Doyle's working life – on his pamphlet-writing, his unceasing correspondence, his dominant role in Episcopal conferences, his appearances before parliamentary inquiries, his extraordinary capacity to encourage, to convince, to charm and it must be said, to bully. The reader is left in no doubt regarding Doyle's single-minded pursuit of his goals but is left wondering about the basis for his understanding of the mission of the Catholic Church in Ireland.

Doubtless Doyle himself might have explained that he had an unswerving faith and that that was the end of the matter. Some modern readers may not be as readily satisfied, and I hope that I am not lessening the extent of Dr. McGrath's fine achievement when I express the wish to know more about the sources of Doyle's single-minded energy. I finished this wonderful book seeing him less as a human being with ordinary emotions and anxieties and more as an automation driven by an invisible, intangible motor. We get a fleeting glimpse of Doyle on his way to Tramore and we note that it was for health reasons, almost as if his public acts were all that mattered, actions that could be interrupted but briefly and then perhaps only under doctor's orders.

Again, we are told that during the eighteen months preceding his death on 15 June 1834, Doyle's participation in public affairs was negligible and, in one poignant sentence, that several contemporaries observed that he was visibly dying. How he might have felt during those last months or how he might have looked back over an extraordinary life and judged its achievements remains veiled: when there were no public statements being issued it was as if there was no longer a human spirit. Maybe that is the way it was but, if so, there may be some readers who might be curious as to why it was so. Biography - the life of the person outside of his work as well as within and as part of that work – can justly claim to have a part in historical studies and one of the achievements of this volume is that it leaves the reader still curious regarding the nature of those mysterious inner springs.

John Logan



**Studies in Irish Cistercian History.** By Colmcille Ó Conbhuidhe OCSO. (Four Courts Press, Dublin, 1998). 260 pp. £14.95 & £39.50.

**The Cistercian Abbeys of Tipperary.** By Colmcille Ó Conbhuidhe OCSO. (Four Courts Press, Dublin, 1999). 336 pp. £14.95 & £39.50.

In an obituary in this Journal for 1993, Prof. Roger Stalley referred to the fact that much of Fr Colmcille's scholarship appeared in the journal *Cîteaux* which "is virtually unobtainable in Irish public libraries ... so Father Colmcille's research has never reached the academic audience it deserves." We should therefore have been indebted to Four Courts Press for remedying this situation in the two volumes under review. However, it is to be regretted that one must have serious reservations about recommending either and that these reservations can be attributed to the editor of both volumes.

The series of papers published under the title *Studies in Irish Cistercian History* give an almost complete history of the order in Ireland over 300 years from the attempted reforms in the later fifteenth century to the death of Father Edmund Cormick, "the last of the Irish Cistercians of the old regime" (p. 249). It is clear that Fr Colmcille set out to write an account of the Cistercian order in Ireland in serial form as the articles appeared in print, in chronological order, over the period 1957 to 1969. When he set out on this course, Fr Colmcille could not have known that his history would be completed on the eve of another chapter in the history of the order in Ireland. In a moving coda, his final words (p. 250) were:

Even while this article was being written a bill was introduced into *Dáil Éireann* (21st January 1969) making provision for the restoration and reconstruction of the abbey church as the parish church of Holy Cross; and in recording that happy and momentous event we may fittingly end our account of the Irish Cistercians.

For the early history of the Cistercians in Ireland, Fr Colmcille's two books *The Story of Mellifont* (Dublin 1958) and *Comhcheilg na Mainistreach Móire* (Dublin 1968) – both sadly out of print – need to be consulted. *Studies in Irish Cistercian History* begins with the reform of the Order's houses in Britain and Ireland ordered by the General Chapter in 1445. By the later fifteenth century the fortunes of the Cistercians had fallen into such decline that only three of the forty houses in Ireland were able to pay the annual contribution to the Order. The reasons for this state of affairs are complex but the reformers noted in particular the imposition of commendatory abbots by Rome, the tributes paid to local rulers and the constant wars. The monasteries had become progressively secularised so that by the early sixteenth century many foundations had only a few monks. Fr Colmcille made use of texts, published and unpublished in Latin, Irish, French and English, for many of which he provided his own translations. He was well aware of the limitations of the surviving evidence and was critical of some of it – in particular the seventeenth-century writers Malachy Hartry and Anthony Bruodin.

A word must be said about the editing, which falls short of what one would have expected. These shortcomings are evident from the cover. Both volumes claim on the cover and title page that they are edited by Finbarr Donovan with a foreword by Roger Stalley. In fact, Professor Stalley's foreword only appears in the first volume, *Studies in Irish Cistercian History*. The fifteen articles appeared in the journals *Collectanea Ordinis Cisterciensium Reformatorum* and *Cîteaux* and are reprinted here, as originally published and with new pagination. It is not clear why the editor dispensed with the original titles of the articles in favour of an arrangement into seven chapters, sometimes divided into two or three parts. Chapter seven, entitled "The Final Phase (1650-1752)", has a "Part I" but we are left to wonder whether this is all that ever appeared or



whether "Part II" has been omitted or is merely an editorial error. In addition to the reprinted essays, the editor has contributed a map of Cistercian monasteries as a frontispiece, a preface, a bibliography of Fr Colmcille's works and an index. Sadly, all have major shortcomings.

The short, three-page "preface" by the editor, Finbarr Donovan, does not, in fact, make any reference at all to the collection of papers which follows but is merely another biographical sketch of Fr Colmcille and contains little editorial information. The editor should have pointed out in his preface that the articles are reprinted directly as they appeared originally, the only difference being that the pagination has been altered. Incredibly, he does not cite where each chapter or chapter part was originally published and the articles reprinted as Chapter 5 (Parts I and II) and Chapter 7, Part I do not even appear in his bibliography! For the reader's information, the chapters and chapter parts originally appeared as follows:

- Chapter 1, Part I – *Collectanea Ordinis Cisterciensium Reformatorum* 18 (1956), 290-305
- Chapter 1, Part II – *Collectanea Ordinis Cisterciensium Reformatorum* 19 (1957), 146-62
- Chapter 1, Part III – *Collectanea Ordinis Cisterciensium Reformatorum* 19 (1957), 371-84
- Chapter 2, Part I – *Cîteaux* 10 (1959), 44-61
- Chapter 2, Part II – *Cîteaux* 10 (1959), 107-24
- Chapter 2, Part III – *Cîteaux* 10 (1959), 199-211
- Chapter 3 – *Cîteaux* 16 (1965), 5-28
- Chapter 4, Part I – *Cîteaux* 16 (1965), 177-87
- Chapter 4, Part II – *Cîteaux* 16 (1965), 257-77
- Chapter 4, Part III – *Cîteaux* 17 (1966), 5-24
- Chapter 5, Part I – *Cîteaux* 18 (1967), 38-50
- Chapter 5, Part II – *Cîteaux* 18 (1967), 152-63
- Chapter 6, Part I – *Cîteaux* 19 (1968), 325-50
- Chapter 6, Part II – *Cîteaux* 20 (1969), 170-81
- Chapter 7, Part I – *Cîteaux* 20 (1969), 181-96

The preface also makes no reference to the bibliography of Fr Colmcille's work, which unaccountably appears at the end of the volume, rather than after the preface. Given the editor's slipshod approach, his bibliography of Fr Colmcille's publications should be treated with extreme caution. A cursory check through Hayes's catalogue in the National Library of Ireland has revealed two articles not included (and there may well be others):

"Excavations at Old Mellifont", *Seanchas Ardmhacha*, 1, 2 (1955), 192-4.

"Poems in Irish to St Colmcille", *Donegal Annual*, 5, 3 (1963), 244.

There are far too many typographical errors in the few pages taken up by the preface, bibliography and index. A particular (computer-?) gremlin has afflicted the index with such peculiarities as "Abbeyieix", "Abbeyiara" and "Isabelia". Abbeyieix and Inisloughnaght are misspelt in the index as are as the Latin titles given to Duiske Abbey – "de Valle Salvatods" (*recte* "de valle Sancti Salvatoris") and Kilbeggan – "Benediatio Dei" (*recte* "Benedictio Dei"). Holy Cross and Middleton on the frontispiece map of Cistercian foundations are spelt differently in the index. While the above can be put down to slipshod typesetting and proofing, what is even more serious is the fact that in both the bibliography and the preface, no accents appear (e.g. "Clo Uí Mheara" for "Cló Uí Mheára"). Even worse is the apparently deliberate anglicisation of Irish accents so that "Ó Fiach" becomes "O'Fiaich", "Ó Cuilleannáin" becomes

“O’Cuilleannain” and elementary spelling mistakes such as “*Seanchas Ardmacha*” instead of “*Seanchas Ardmhacha*” also occur. Given that the editor speaks eloquently of Fr Colmcille’s love of the Irish language in his preface this is all the more unforgivable.

A good editor would have served his reader by providing, in the index, a comprehensive correlation of the differing names (Irish, Latin and English) by which Irish Cistercian monasteries are known. Fr Colmcille in his text was often inconsistent in his use of names when referring to the same monastery. The editor has not only not noticed this but himself uses different forms to refer to the same site. Thus the foundation named Monasteranenagh, Co. Limerick in the map on the frontispiece does not appear in that form in the index but rather under “Nenay (Maigue)”, while in the text Fr Colmcille uses Maigue and Nenay. Similarly, Abbeylara, Co. Longford on the map appears in the index as “Granard (Abbeiyara [sic])”; Abington appears as “Owney (Abington)” in the index while Middleton is consistently referred to as “Chore” by Fr Colmcille but is listed under Middleton in the index.

While *Studies in Irish Cistercian History* is a straight reprint of articles which have appeared elsewhere, the second volume under review – *The Cistercian Abbeys of Tipperary* – is compiled from a more disparate set of sources. These are outlined in the Editor’s preface (pp. 7-10) and consist of a combination of published works and unpublished lecture and research notes left behind by Fr Colmcille. These are supplemented by material from Prof. Mac Niocaill’s book *Na Manaigh Liatha in Éirinn 1142 – c.1600* and references from the *Calendar of Papal Registers*. One would have expected far more information than this. Where, for instance, are Fr Colmcille’s papers housed? Have they been indexed? Apart from being used as a source for the lists of abbots for individual houses, we do not know what other material from Prof. Mac Niocaill’s book was used as it is not referred to in the text.

The arrangement of the book is curious. It contains twenty-one chapters, arranged in five parts. It begins and ends with a general introduction and an epilogue, drawn from *The Story of Mellifont* and from some of Fr Colmcille’s unpublished notes. The core of the book consists of accounts of the abbeys of Inisloughnaght, Holy Cross, Kilcooly and Hore. These had already appeared in print elsewhere. As with the previous volume, the editor does not impart crucial information on his methods of operation. We are not told, for example, whether the accounts are reprinted here unchanged or whether there have been substantial additions or alterations to the published texts. For instance, it would have been useful to have a note of the fact that, in the contribution on Kilcooly, additional paragraphs containing new information have been added at pp. 289-90, and that otherwise this section is a reprint of Fr Colmcille’s articles in the *Old Kilkenny Review* (1984-1985).

Appendices have been added to the account of each of the four Cistercian houses which contain such diverse material as a list of abbots, notes on the lands of each foundation, notes on historical sources and finally descriptions of the visible architectural remains. The latter are drawn primarily from the nineteenth-century *Ordnance Survey Letters*, from a manuscript (now in Mount Melleray) of the 1920s compiled by Canon Power and from Prof. Stalley’s *Cistercian Monasteries of Ireland*. The wisdom of including the descriptions on the architectural remains is to be questioned. They do not add significantly to Fr Colmcille’s narratives and give the impression of appended notes. Curiously, although the editor prints Canon Power’s manuscript descriptions, he makes no mention of Power’s article “The Cistercian Abbeys of Munster” published in the *Journal of the Cork Historical and Archaeological Society* 43 (1938), pp. 1-11 and 96-100, which was presumably based on these unpublished notes. Similarly, while the notes on sources contain much useful material, they would have benefited at the hands of a good editor.

Again, there is evidence here of sloppy editing. In the preface the editor succeeds in getting the title (p. 7) and the date of publication (p. 9) of Fr Colmcille's *The Story of Mellifont* wrong, as well as misspelling Prof. Mac Niocaill's *Na Manaigh Liatha in Éirinn 1142 – c. 1600*. Unlike the articles in *Studies in Irish Cistercian History* which were straight reprints, in the Tipperary volume the text has been reset and this is where the editor is to be seriously faulted. There can be up to half a dozen typographical errors on a single page. This is simply unacceptable and, apart from being frustrating and annoying, the result of such a careless approach is that we cannot be confident that the editor has done justice either to Fr Colmcille's original published work or to his additional unpublished notes.

There is, for example, no consistency whatsoever in the spelling of personal or place-names. The name of the Papal Legate and abbot of Mellifont Gilla Críst Ua Connairche is spelt six different ways in the book (three variations appear on p. 67 alone!); there are five variants given for that of the abbot of Holy Cross Peter Ó Conaing and there are no less than **eleven** different spellings used in the case of Domnall Mór Ó Briain, king of Thomond. As with the previous volume, the names of Cistercian monasteries may appear in their English, Irish or Latin forms. For example, Monasteranenagh is listed in the index as "Mainistir-an-aeanaigh (Maigue)", whereas Middleton is listed as "Chore abbey (Midleton)". There is a lack of consistency in some of the citations used in the footnotes. References to the five-volume published *Calendar of Ormond Deeds* may or may not contain the volume, page and deed number (compare pp. 187, 188 and 191). All this serves to distract from Fr Colmcille's fluent text and it would have been better if the original articles were simply reprinted like those in the earlier volume.

The overall impression from both works is that they were compiled in haste and lack focus. I have never come across two publications with so many typographical errors and so little editorial direction. In the hands of a competent editor they would have been fitting monuments to Fr Colmcille's work but, at best, one must regrettably conclude that they are seriously flawed. One would also have expected better from Four Courts Press, who have in recent years established a well-earned reputation for publishing high-standard new and reprinted works in the field of Irish history. Sadly, on this occasion they have been a grave disappointment.

Raghnall Ó Floinn

**The Burning of Bridget Cleary – a true story.** By Angela Bourke (Pimlico, 1999). 240 pages. £10.00 sterling.

Michael Cleary looks out at us from the cover of Angela Bourke's book. In a mug shot taken as he began his prison sentence in 1895 for the killing of his wife Bridget, the image he presents is far from any Punch-like stereotype of an ignorant Irish peasant. The gaze is both penetrating and impenetrable, conjuring worlds both compellingly immediate and irretrievably distant. Samuel Johnson said: "What is known can seldom be immediately told; and, when it might be told, it is no longer known".

The terrible events of March 1895 at Ballyvadlea are too well known in terms of basic facts to need repeating here. The continuing fascination of the case has not so much revolved around what happened, but how it happened, and what it meant. In some respects the affair must always remain a mystery. About it, however, Angela Bourke has written a book which is breathtaking in its scope and originality of approach and illumination. The very brilliance of her interdisciplinary approach may unsettle conventional historians, some of whom tend to equate dullness with scholarship, and recognise documented fact as the sole standard of measurable truth about the past.

Ms. Bourke writes like an angel, if the pun may be pardoned; but her creative ability can also draw upon an array of hard-core scholarly gifts which in this book tellingly reinforce each other. A paper by her on one aspect of the burning of Bridget Cleary appeared in the 1998 issue of this Journal and gave some fascinating foretaste of some of the elements in her new book.

As a writer she seems incapable of penning a dull paragraph. She is also perhaps uniquely positioned to lend a proper accord and stature to the claims and insights of folklore and the nature of oral culture as important aids to understanding what happened in the Clearys' cottage in March 1895. Quite early in the book she makes an explicit apologia for the study of folklore as a wholly legitimate method of historical illumination, indispensable in this case. That claim possibly needs to be forcefully asserted, especially amongst Irish historians, all too many of whom attempt access to the Irish mind through the front door and ground floor of English language sources only.

The clarifying structure of Angela Bourke's book lies in its illumination of the interface and interaction of mutually uncomprehending worlds, still to an appreciable extent co-existing in rural Ireland at the end of the nineteenth century:

The wider importance of this story lies in the clash it illustrates between two different world views . . . two ways of accounting for the irrational, at a time of profound social, economic and cultural change. The intolerable pressures that were brought to bear on Michael Cleary, to make him behave as he did, were not personal or domestic only. The kitchen in Ballyvadlea was another crucible: a microcosm of a larger world in which political and economic issues exerted inexorable influences upon the lives of individuals.

It would be totally misleading, however, to convey the impression that Angela Bourke's book primarily exploits the Ballyvadlea case as grist for sociological or ideological theorising or agenda. This is quite literally a storybook, and crammed with carefully researched detail and circumstantial fact, meticulously referenced. It is attractively produced, with a section of illustrations that includes morbidly compelling photographs of the Cleary cottage, bedroom and kitchen, taken by an official RIC photographer, Constable Thomas McLoughlin, only days after the event and the finding of the victim's body. One small quibble: in the regional map amongst the book's preliminary pages both Cashel and Carrick-on-Suir have unaccountably gone with the fairies.

As climax to the narrative the final terrible night of Bridget Cleary's life on Friday 15 March 1895 is reconstructed and retold with a sense of stunning immediacy and atmosphere that leaves the reader shaken and shocked at the distance of more than a century. Yet, in the end, there are no out and out villains. Angela Bourke brings us to the point where we can feel human pity for each and all of the players caught up in this terrible episode. That in itself is a remarkable achievement, a measure of the understanding of the events at Ballyvadlea that has been cumulatively arrived at through the breadth of the author's knowledge, humane sympathy and informed respect for place, people, and culture, past and present.

By inescapable definition there is a feminist dimension both to the story itself and its telling. It is, after all, the story of the appalling killing of a woman after her abuse and torture by her husband and others. But in Ms. Bourke's telling there is no trace of the kind of designer victimology in which the story could be predictably vested in our time. Part of the story, in fact, concerns *the use of the story* – how the Ballyvadlea narrative was ideologically exploited by various interests in its own time.

To call the occurrence a "witch burning", as it was often subsequently described, or even

more glibly “the last witch-burning in Europe”, was wholly misleading and inaccurate; a historical nonsense at several levels, not least the self-congratulatory implication that modern Europe – the twentieth-century arena of unprecedented mass horror – was done with such barbarism while South Tipp had yet to catch up.

The evil and pervading cruelty of the killing of Bridget Cleary cannot be diminished or downplayed, but the legal process of the time was surely correct in not defining it as premeditated murder. At the heart of the tragedy there still lies something timeless: the ultimately unknowable nature, to the outsider, of intimate relationships between a man and a woman. This remains the core of the mystery. It seems more than probable that there was some motivating dysfunction in the marriage of Michael and Bridget Cleary: what exactly it was is never likely to be known.

In a highly affirmative blurb Seamus Deane describes Angela Bourke’s book as “a classic account”. Only time can ultimately confirm the definitive description “classic”. In this case however, I would put my money on it.

*Michael Coady*

**Famine Diary.** By Brendan Ó Cathaoir. (Irish Academic Press, Dublin, 1999). 210 pages. £18.95.

This work by the well-known historian and *Irish Times* journalist was very well received when it was published in *The Irish Times* on a weekly basis from September 1995 to December 1997. Based on contemporary eyewitness accounts of the famine drawn from national and provincial newspapers and many other sources, this diary proved to be one of the highlights of the 150th anniversary commemorations. It brought home to readers the profound horror and the unrelenting nature of the greatest social catastrophe in Irish history.

In 1998 the diary gave way in *The Irish Times* to one dealing with the bicentenary of the 1798 rebellion. The famine, of course, continued as a national catastrophe up to 1850 and as a regional event in places such as Clare as late as 1852/1853. The author here gives the diary as published in his newspaper and adds a chapter covering the period 1848-1850 with endnotes and a bibliographical note. Professor Joe Lee has provided a foreword.

Ó Cathaoir knows this ground particularly well as he has already written a biography of the Young Irelander and sometime Tipperary M.P., John Blake Dillon, which was reviewed in this journal in 1991. The author is also known in Tipperary for his participation in summer schools such as the Kickham Weekend in Mullinahone. This book deals thoroughly with all the major themes of the famine which there is no need to recite here. References to County Tipperary feature regularly throughout. Indeed, the book was launched by a Tipperary man, Dr. Martin Mansergh, special advisor to the Taoiseach, one of whose ancestors, John Mansergh, is mentioned in this work as secretary of the Tipperary town relief committee.

Ó Cathaoir quotes the famous statement of Archbishop Slattery of Cashel and Emly on the degrading effects of the famine on the human character. Slattery wrote to the president of Maynooth College, his fellow county man, Fr. Laurence Renehan (entry for 12 July 1847), that “we are still struggling with famine and fever and, what is more than both, the demoralisation of our people consequent on the system of relief that this incapable government has inflicted on our country. Every feeling of decent spirit and of truth has vanished, and instead there is created for us a cringing lying population, a Nation of Beggars”.

This is a theme also found in another source used by the author, the diary of the Clonoulty curate, Fr. Thomas O’Carroll. He was not impressed with the conduct of comfortable farmers nominating their own relations for the public works. He wrote (entry for 14 September 1846): “I was slow to believe that there were so much baseness and corruption in the Irish character, as I

have seen manifested lately in the meetings of and the applications to our committee for employment on the public works”.

The terrible choices faced by famine victims are recounted. Michael Doheny, County Tipperary’s leading Young Irelander, reported from Cashel (entry for 19 April 1847) that he knew of three or four cases “where a father and mother went away by night and left three little children, scarcely more than infants, to a person to be taken next morning to the poorhouse. It may be said that this was cruel and unnatural, but those who say so little know what that father and mother may have endured – how much they struggled to avoid this awful sacrifice”. Ó Cathaoir comments: “this practice is quite widespread. Imagine the legacy of guilt and bitterness which those people carry to America. They generally intend to send for their children, if successful in the New World”.

William Smith O’Brien, M.P., leader of the Young Irelanders, is an important figure in this book. He was a voice of sanity and reason who made compelling criticisms of government family policy in the House of Commons. He became so exasperated by the failure of the government to respond adequately to the famine that he was driven to rebellion at Ballingarry in County Tipperary in 1848.

In this context it is worth noting with a gratitude (which, one hopes, will be shared by all readers of the *Tipperary Historical Journal*) that in 1998 the government, led by Taoiseach, Bertie Ahern, commemorated the 150th anniversary of Smith O’Brien’s Rising by acquiring the “Warehouse” – scene of the Rising – on behalf of the nation. A permanent state exhibition under *Dúchas* on the Young Ireland movement (in the context of the famine, mass emigration, and 1848 as a year of revolution across Europe) is to be the centre-piece of the restoration of the house which is now under way.

At the onset of the famine Smith O’Brien was Daniel O’Connell’s deputy leader in the Repeal Association. In the diary for 9 December 1845 we find him warning the British government that the Irish people will not lie down and die. He considered it the government’s duty to provide work for the people. He informed the House of Commons (entry for 16 March 1846) that he had seen families sitting down to a meal of potatoes “which any member of the house would be sorry to offer his hogs”. He wanted parliament to compel absentee Irish landlords to return to their estates to do their duty by the people.

The diary entry for 20 April 1846 begins: “William Smith O’Brien believes there would be no famine if Ireland was self-governing”. “How different would have been the conduct of an Irish government and an Irish parliament”, Smith O’Brien asserts. “An Irish government would have summoned an Irish parliament to meet in November [1845] last, to consider the steps necessary to meet the unforeseen calamity, instead of coupling measures of coercion and relief . . . out of the resources of Ireland they would have made preparations to prevent famine among the people”. Smith O’Brien stated that he would hold British ministers responsible for premature loss of life. It was monstrous, Smith O’Brien contended, to talk of the rights of property when people were starving.

Ó Cathaoir’s entry for 27 April 1846 records: “Outside Clonmel, four or five thousand of the unemployed and destitute poor attack Mrs. Shanahan’s mill in Marlfield and carry off several sacks of flour. The military is called out to protect property. As the soldiers march through Clonmel, with mounted artillery, they are passed by at least 250 carts laden with flour for export (the property mainly of Messrs. Grubb and Sargent) coming from Cahir, under a heavy escort of cavalry and infantry. The barges leave Clonmel once a week [for Waterford], with the export supplies under convoy which . . . consisted of two guns, fifty cavalry and eighty infantry escorting them on the banks of the Suir as far as Carrick”.

This same diary entry records Smith O'Brien's comment that "The circumstance which appeared most aggravating was that the people were starving in the midst of plenty, and that every tide carried from the Irish ports corn sufficient for the maintenance of thousands of the Irish people". Ó Cathaoir subsequently quotes from Smith O'Brien's journal written in penal exile in Tasmania (and recently edited by Richard Davis), wherein he did indeed hold the British government responsible for the "premature extinction" of one million Irish people . . . "Englishmen and their rulers calmly contemplate without self-reproach the havoc which they have permitted, if they have not caused it – nay some of their leading statesmen deem it a subject of congratulations that so large a proportion of its inhabitants has been removed from a country which they considered overpeopled and hostile".

Brendan Ó Cathaoir and his publisher are to be congratulated on bringing this diary – a most useful and accessible work of public remembrance on the most tragic period in Irish history – to readers in permanent form.

Thomas McGrath

**The diocese of Killaloe, 1850-1904.** By Ignatius Murphy. (Four Courts Press, Dublin, 1995). 527 pages. £30.

This is the final volume of the late Monsignor Ignatius Murphy's trilogy on the history of the diocese of Killaloe from 1700-1904. The earlier volumes: *The diocese of Killaloe in the eighteenth century* (Dublin, 1991), and *The diocese of Killaloe, 1800-1850* (Dublin, 1992), were reviewed in this journal in 1992 and 1993 respectively.

The scale of the author's achievement is now clear, as this work maintains the standard set in the other books. Dr. Murphy's historical methodology is scholarly and constructively critical; it is not hagiographical. He places the history of Killaloe diocese very much in the context of the general history of Ireland and it is all the better for that. In this comprehensive work it is hard to point to anything which the author has overlooked. There are many useful insights; invariably he has a telling detail which is just right.

The national synod of Thurles in 1850 provides a starting point for the author. It issued a synodical address which condemned, in scathing terms, the widespread evictions of the later famine years. The poor, it stated, were "frequently the victims of the most ruthless oppression that ever disgraced the annals of humanity . . . we see them treated with a cruelty which would cause the heart to ache if inflicted on the beasts of the field . . . The desolating track of the exterminator is to be traced in too many parts of the country . . .".

Interdenominational relations were worse than usual in the 1850s and 1860s. The synod of Thurles recommended the holding of missions to counteract the activities of Protestant missionary societies. Missions were common in Killaloe diocese in the 1850s. Mission crosses were erected in the grounds of the parish church as a permanent reminder of the mission and these are the subject of an appendix. It is interesting that the inspiration for these missions was to counter a perceived pastoral threat rather than to remedy pastoral deficiencies.

Michael Flannery, who became bishop of the diocese in 1859, suffered a health breakdown; from 1863 he spent the rest of his episcopacy in Paris. He was almost forgotten in Killaloe as the diocese was governed by a series of coadjutors, but he remained bishop until his death in 1891. Flannery outlived two of his three coadjutors. In 1871, Cardinal Cullen was prepared to block the appointment of Thomas McRedmond as coadjutor bishop on the grounds that his mother, a widow, and two of his sisters had married Protestants (pp 81-82). McRedmond eventually became coadjutor bishop in 1889. After 1850 the lay voice in the church was largely inaudible.

Cullen dominated the third quarter of the nineteenth century. As Dr. Murphy asserts, where O'Connell had been able to question episcopal policy within the church over forty years, there was now no strong lay voice.

Dr. Murphy devotes a chapter to priests, politics and fenians in the 1850s and 1860s. He acknowledges the work of Dr. James O'Shea throughout the book. Priests were very critical in county elections to parliament. Candidates did not have any hope of success without the support of the clergy. The execution of the McCormack brothers in 1858 may have led to support for fenianism in Tipperary. Fenianism was stronger in mid and south than in north Tipperary. This was clearly seen in the voting for O'Donovan Rossa and Kickham. On the church's hostility to the fenians, Dr. Murphy writes: "The fenians had ignored denunciations by the church authorities, assisted by the fact that the Irish clergy had become so involved in politics that there could be confusion between their political roles and their roles as moral teachers" (pp 254-5).

Thomas Croke expressed concern in 1864 that "emigration will leave us soon, I fear, without any Catholic population at all . . .". The ratio of priests to people improved dramatically in the second half of the nineteenth century. By 1900 the average size of a parish had been reduced from the 7,000-8,000 of the mid-1840s to 2,000-3,000. The church made great strides forward in all areas towards uniformity and conformity, though traditional superstitions were not entirely eradicated. " 'Pishoges' concerning milk, butter and eggs survived strongly in some places throughout the nineteenth century and were still very much alive in a few parts of West Clare over one hundred years after . . . 1868" (p. 280). Church-building continued apace. Nenagh church was the first church built in the diocese of Killaloe in the nineteenth century. Terryglass church was unique in being financed completely by a local family, the Hickies of Slevoir House. New religious orders came into the diocese, marking a huge contrast with the position in 1800. The foundation of the Cistercians in Roscrea is examined (pp 150-154).

The diocese college, St. Flannan's, opened in 1881. Dr. Murphy writes: "The rule requiring all candidates for the diocesan priesthood in Killaloe to receive their secondary education at the diocesan college also had an unforeseen consequence by further narrowing the social group from whom the diocesan priests were drawn" (p. 115). Three-quarters of all clerical students went to Maynooth, the rest to the Irish College, Paris (where there was a long Killaloe tradition), with a few going to Rome.

By the end of the nineteenth century the "modern Irish Church" model had been well established in Killaloe. The author concludes that a person born in Killaloe diocese in 1890 could see little change in his parish during a lifetime lasting until the early 1960s – a period characterised by "a stability which lasted so long that, arguably, it led eventually to stagnation" (p. 283).

There are very few errors of fact or typography in this work. However, the *Nation* newspaper was founded in 1842, not 1843 (p. 202). There is an element of repetition from the first and second volumes in the overview of the bishops in chapter thirteen. Appendices on chapels and churches built or renovated between 1850 and 1904 and also on priests' obituaries are continuations of appendices in the earlier volumes and are extremely useful, the latter especially as a genealogical resource. Taken as a whole, this work constitutes an important contribution to national church history and is an indispensable source for the regional historian. There is plenty to interest the reader who resides in that part of Killaloe diocese which lies within County Tipperary. Undoubtedly the trilogy constitutes the standard work on Killaloe diocese over the two centuries in question.

Thomas McGrath



**A Tipperary Landed Estate: Castle Otway 1750-1853.** By Miriam Lambe. Maynooth Studies in Local History, Number 17 (Irish Academic Press, 1998). 45 pp. £5.95.

For some years, Maynooth has not only been running a very successful post-graduate course in local history but has to date published, in a series of twenty pamphlets, some of the results of that research. (The twentieth pamphlet and of interest to Tipperary readers, a study of marriage and property in eighteenth century Limerick, by the English historian T.C. Barnard, is an exception to this.) The pamphlet under review is the first in the series to deal with Tipperary history.

The Otways were one of those Tipperary landed families who owed their position to an ancestor having served in the army of Cromwell. By the mid-nineteenth century the family had some six-and-a-half thousand acres near Nenagh. After the Act of Union the family was largely absentee but continued to have an impact on the region. The only member of the family to make a bigger than local "splash" was Robert Otway Cave, who represented the county at Westminster in the late 1830s and early '40s. Given the circumstances of the founding of the family in Ireland, this gentleman's politics were progressive enough to earn from the great O'Connell such lavish praise as "the House of Commons does not contain a man of more pure, honourable and patriotic mind".

This study, because of the availability of sources, starts around 1750 and closes in 1853 with the sale of the property in the Encumbered Estates Court. It therefore goes from famine to famine, along the way charting a local response to the economic ups and downs of a century or so. The story is told in three sections. The first deals with the estate during the second half of the eighteenth century and centres on Thomas Otway (1731-86) as landlord, making the case that in his relations with his tenants he has been too harshly judged.

It is not made clear to what extent he was an "improving" landlord, a matter on which perceptions of harshness or benevolence very much depend. Given the scanty nature of source material, the writer's discussion of the role of agents is of interest. The agent in 1827 writing to his boss in London, confessing his inability to sort-out a particular problem and asking Otway Cave to come home for at least a week, cannot have impressed. It appears that the agent in question did not keep his job for long.

The second section deals with the latter part of the period and, with more sources available, the emphasis is placed on the tenantry. The writer's claim that labour on the estate was provided not just by cottiers but by tenant farmers needs clarification. The statement that MacCarthy of Springhouse (not "Springfield") was a middleman on the Butler (Cahir) estate, is not correct. The example cited of a landlord in 1847 using tenant right as a spur to emigration deserves more detailed treatment. The extent to which the "Ulster Custom" was in operation outside that province has not been sufficiently noted in general works on the period.

It may well be that the demands of the format of this series constrain the writers to omit some of their research. The relationship between thesis and pamphlet is not clear. Perhaps the writer will address some of these topics in a future issue of this journal. Another topic of great interest is the impact of population increases on the estate. The notion that cottiers did not form a significant element on the estate prior to the Famine seems exceptional. The surrender of a lease in 1834 is mentioned, which added around 34 tenants to the direct control of the estate. Were these holdings viable? What was the history of evictions on the estate during the late 1840s? Do the unpublished, limited but detailed official records of evictions in the National Archives provide any information on this?

The third section of this study looks at the Castle Otway/Templederry community in the contexts of education, religion and (being Tipperary) the ready application of violence as a

mechanism of protest. In trying to recover something of the lives of ordinary people during the early decades of the nineteenth century the writer faces the difficulty at the heart of all such attempts, namely the fact that the sources allowing the most intimate glimpses of such lives, the records of crime, by definition do not concentrate on 'normal' life and are generally geared to an official perspective.

For example, in 1847, a caretaker on the Otway estate and a man seemingly known personally by Mrs. Otway Cave, was murdered. This individual had been (was?) a notorious faction leader and perhaps his death was no more than his past catching up with him. As the writer makes clear, an incident like this prompts a host of questions but allows no more than a picket of answers.

This study of a Tipperary family and their estate is a welcome addition to the not very large but thankfully growing body of well researched Tipperary history. As one would expect, it has maps, tables, source citations and a photograph of the ruins of Castle Otway. Hopefully, now that a start has been made, further pamphlets in this series will illuminate other aspects of the county's history.

*Denis G. Marnane*

## Notices

**God be with the Chimneys of Cappawhite.** By Bob Conway (The Central Press, Bray, Co. Wicklow, 1998). 193 pages. £8.99.

The author, born in Cappawhite in 1926, left it in 1954 and worked as a pharmacist, but these affectionate memoirs suggest that he never really left the community of his youth. His father was principal of the Vocational School in that village for many years and in a very anecdotal style, the sights, scenes and characters of a vanished era are revived.

**Jack Judge the Tipperary Man.** By Verna Hale Gibbons (Sandwell Community Library Service, 1998). 316 pages. £11.60.

It's a Long Way to Tipperary, one of the best known songs of the 20th century, was written by Jack Judge (1872-1938), whose first biography this is, produced as part of a flowering of local history in the British West Midlands. Written in a breathless style, this book tells all one might need to know (and more) about the man who made Tipperary famous.

**The Centenary Co-operative Creamery Society Ltd: A Century of Co-operative Endeavour 1898-1998.** By Raymond Smith (Mount Cross Publishers, Dublin, 1998). 176 pages. £5.

This mix of social and economic history does what the title indicates. There are lots of photographs and an index.

**The Roscrea Conference: Celebrating 25 Consecutive Years 1987-1999.** (Roscrea People). £5 postage paid.



A 36-page commemorative booklet, no author acknowledged – but no prize for guessing his identity, concealed behind that of “Editorial Assistant Carmel Cunningham”. A worthwhile souvenir; but only while stocks last.

**Full Tide – a miscellany.** By Michael Coady. (Relay Books, Tyone, Nenagh, 1999). 182 pages, £12.65.

The sub-title tells it all – prose, poetry, autobiography and (incredibly) a *photograph* of a Carrick woman born 214 years ago, who died 142 years ago!

**The Life and Times of a Railwayman: Limerick Junction 150 Years On.** By P. J. Slattery (Published by the author, 1998). 257 pages. £10.

This attractively produced and well illustrated account of the well-known railway station is a mixture of railway history and personal experiences, by a man whose working life and that of his father were spent on the railway. All aspects of life in Limerick Junction are entertainingly dealt with by this writer.

**Growing Up in Carefree Days: Life in Rural Ireland as it was.** By Pat Slattery (The Rose Press, Garryroon, Cahir, 1998). 190 pages. £6.

Written by the well-known rose grower, who was born in Rehill near Cahir in 1916, one of ten children. Written in a colloquial style, this memoir has a very strong sense of family, rooted in place.

**The Famine in the Kilkenny/Tipperary Region: A History of the Callan Workhouse and Poor Law Union, 1845-1852** (Callan Heritage Society, 1998). 102 pages. £6.50.

This is a very well produced book, the front cover photograph being particularly evocative. Most of the text was written by John Walsh and there is a section on the Famine in Slieverardagh by Dr. William Nolan. Many of the official voices are allowed speak for themselves.

**Boherlahan-Dualla Historical Journal, 1998.** Edited by Peter Meskell and Marian Ryan (Boherlahan/Dualla Historical Journal Society, 1998). 106 pages.

For a small historical society covering a small geographical area, this is an ambitious publication, for which the society in question deserve congratulations. Among the articles of interest are accounts of Andrew Finn, author of books on Cashel Corporation and The Rock; the building of the railway line from Goolds Cross to Cashel 100 years ago and something of the history of the Max and Phillips families of Gaile. This publication also carries a well-judged selection of photographs. Hopefully, a second issue will be forthcoming.

**Catherine Mahon, First Woman President of the INTO.** By Síle Chuinneagáin (INTO, 1998). 232 pages. £5.

The subject of this study was born in Laccah in North Tipperary in 1869 and became the first



woman president of INTO in 1912-13. While concentrating on INTO matters, this study also offers much of interest with respect to issues of gender a century or so ago.

**Newport, Co. Tipperary: The Town, Its Court and Gaols.** By William J. Hayes (Lisheen Publications, Roscrea, 1999). 72 pages. £5.

Written to commemorate the restoration of the bridewell in Newport, this booklet is more than an account of that building. It gives an overview of law and order in the district in the 19th century. It is well illustrated with clear black and white photographs, maps and – a particular feature – sketches. A very attractive publication.

**The Church of SS. Michael & John, Cloughjordan, Co. Tipperary: A Centenary History** (Local Committee, 1999). 56 pages. £3.

In the late 19th century, Cloughjordan was the only town in the diocese of Killaloe not to have a Catholic church. People had to attend the church at Grawn, some two miles from the town. This George Ashlin designed church was built in Cloughjordan a century ago at the end of around £15,000. A feature of the church is glass by Harry Clarke and Evie Hone. This booklet also has a selection of photographs of aspects of local life.

**How We Were – in the parish of Kilbarron-Terryglass, Co. Tipperary.** By Bridie O'Brien (Relay Books, 1999). 396 pages. £12.

The writer, a native of Coolbawn, returned home in 1976 after many years working as a teacher in England. This book is a labour of love and covers all aspects of local life. It is well illustrated, with a good index.

**A Biographical Dictionary of Tipperary.** By Martin O'Dwyer (Folk Village, Cashel, 1999). 444 pages. £20.

A substantial attempt on Tipperary lives with an emphasis on military careers, compiled from standard sources.

**From Bun Ciamalta Vale to New South Wales.** By Roger Kennedy (Relay Books, 1999). 136 pages. £4.95.

The autobiography of a North Tipperary priest (1916-94), who worked in Australia (1943-91).

**Thurles: A Guide to the Cathedral Town.** By William J. Hayes (Lisheen Publications, Roscrea, 1999). 54 pages. £3.50.

This is the second short modern guide to Thurles (the first, by Donal O'Gorman, appeared in 1984) and with its attractive combination of text, maps, photographs and drawings, delivers a very palatable history of the "Cathedral Town". This guide also includes a description of the numerous commemorative plaques about the town and a listing of Thurles writers, past and present.



**Cahir: A Guide to Heritage Town and District.** By David J. Butler (Cahir Tourism-Heritage Association, 1999). 48 pages. £2.00.

Surprisingly, for a town with such an interesting history (not to mention many heritage buildings), Cahir has long lacked a suitable guide book – a deficiency remedied by the publication of this walking tour. While aimed at visitors, this booklet has much to say to locals, giving a depth of fascinating detail, while ensuring that visitors do not feel patronised by bland generalities. A feature of the guide is the use of evocative line drawings by Derek Ryan – a whole series of sketches in place of the more usual photographs. Places of interest in Cahir district are also described. Additionally, this booklet has a biographical dictionary of famous sons and daughters of Cahir and a guide to tracing Cahir ancestors.

**Lackeen: a late medieval and later settlement in Tipperary North Riding.** Edited by Tom Conduit and Gabriel Cooney (Archaeological Ireland, PO Box 69, Bray, Co. Wicklow, 1999). 6 pages. £2.50.

This is Heritage Guide No. 6 of this attractive and excellent series. It describes a neglected historical site, just off R438 near Lorrha, once an O’Kennedy stronghold.

**St. Ailbe’s Heritage – a guide to the history, genealogy and towns of the archdiocese of Cashel & Emly** (Tipperary Heritage Unit, 1999). 124 pages. £6.

This is a report and update of a guide first published in 1994. It was compiled by FÁS trainees at the centre in Tipperary town housing parish records from the diocese of Cashel & Emly. Apart from brief accounts of Cashel, Thurles, Templemore and Tipperary, there are short sketches of notable personalities. Given its publisher, unsurprisingly, the main focus of the guide is an introduction to diocesan “roots”.

**St. Michael’s Parish Church, Tipperary.** By Denis G. Marnane (St. Michael’s Press, Tipperary, 1999). 46 pages. £4.

This is a well illustrated (with some colour photographs by Frank Burgess) history of Tipperary parish church, designed by J. J. McCarthy and built around 1860. The various sections of the booklet deal with the building of the church, its interior, the stained glass and burials in and around the church. Other aspects of parish history or activities are not dealt with.

